1 2 3 4 5 6	Department of Conservation, Geologic Energy Management Division Doug Ito STATE OIL AND GAS SUPERVISOR 715 P Street, MS 19-06 (Legal Office) Sacramento, California 95814 Telephone (916) 323-6733 Facsimile (916) 445-9916
7 8	
9	STATE OF CALIFORNIA
10	
11	
12	GEOLOGIC ENERGY MANAGEMENT DIVISION
13	
14	AMENDED OPDER TO RAY A CIVIL REMALTY
15	AMENDED ORDER TO PAY A CIVIL PENALTY
16	NO. 1460A
17	
18	Operator: Sentinel Peak Resources California LLC (S2641)
19	Operator. Seminer reak kesources Camornia LLC (32041)
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	1
	Order to Pay a Civil Penalty No. 1460A

1

I. Introduction

The State Oil and Gas Supervisor (Supervisor), acting through the Geologic Energy
Management Division (CalGEM), and under the authority of Division 3 of the Public Resources
Code (PRC; commencing with PRC section 3000) and title 14 of the California Code of
Regulations (Regulations), may impose a civil penalty on a person who violates any statutory
provision of the PRC, or any regulation that implements those statutory provisions. (PRC, §
3236.5) The Supervisor shall order remedial work as in his judgment is necessary to prevent
damage to life, health, property, and natural resources. (PRC, § 3224)

9 Based on CalGEM's records, Sentinel Peak Resources California LLC (**Operator**) is or was an "operator" (as defined in PRC, § 3009) and is responsible for the well "Williams" 7, API No. 10 11 0403000763 and associated facilities (the Well). The Well is an idle well and is associated with an underground injection project in the Midway-Sunset Oil Field, UIC Project Code 46400385. 12 Under applicable provisions of Regulations section 1772.1, Operator was required to timely 13 comply with idle well remediation requirements for the Well within 12 months of the 14 15 unsuccessful idle well test it conducted in March 2022, and Operator failed to do so. 16 Operator's failure to timely comply with idle well remediation requirements for the Well 17 constitutes a violation of Regulations sections 1772.1.

In May 2024, the Well was a source of a surface expression on the "Williams" lease,
which resulted in approximately one barrel of oil spilled onto the ground in the Midway-Sunset
Oil Field. Regulations section 1724.11, subdivision (a), mandates that underground injection
projects shall not result in any surface expression. Operator's failure to prevent a surface
expression at its underground injection project constitutes a violation of Regulations section
1724.11.

Therefore, pursuant to PRC sections 3013, 3106, 3206.1, 3224, 3236.5, 3270, and
Regulations sections 1724.11 and 1772.1, the Supervisor is ordering Operator to bring the Well
into compliance with idle well remediation requirements and to pay a civil penalty for each
violation.

28 ///

Attachment A, incorporated herein, contains a list of definitions and authorities that are
 applicable to this order.

3 Failure to Comply with Idle Well Remediation Requirements II. 4 Based on CalGEM's records, at all times relevant to this order, Operator was the 5 operator, as defined in PRC section 3009, of the Well. At all times relevant to this order, the Well 6 was an idle well as defined in PRC section 3008, subdivision (d). 7 As the operator of the Well, Operator was required to comply with idle well remediation 8 requirements for the Well after failing to successfully complete idle well testing, as required by 9 Regulations section 1772.1, subdivision (b), and Operator failed to do so. Regulations section 1772.1, subdivision (b), requires Operator to do one of the following within 12 months of failing 10 11 to successfully complete testing on a well: 12 1) Bring the well into compliance by performing and passing a casing pressure test 13 and performing and passing a clean out tag, as directed in Regulations section 1772.1, subdivision (a); 14 15 2) Partially plug and abandon the well in accordance with Regulations section 16 1752; 17 3) Plug and abandon the well in accordance with PRC section 3208; or 18 4) Schedule the well for plugging and abandonment under an approved Idle Well 19 Management Plan or an approved Testing Waiver Plan. 20 Operator attempted to pressure test the Well in March 2022, but the test was 21 unsuccessful. Operator was required to remediate the well within 12 months, by March 2023, 22 and Operator failed to do so. In April 2023, Operator filed a Notice of Intention in Abeyance to 23 rework the well, and in August 2023, CalGEM issued a permit to Operator to conduct the planned rework. In July 2024, Operator resolved the outstanding violation for the Well which 24 25 was overdue for remediation following unsuccessful idle well testing, 29 months after the failed 26 pressure test and 17 months after the remediation deadline. 27 /// 28 111 3

2 3

25

1

III. Failure to Prevent a Surface Expression

On May 2, 2024, CalGEM observed a surface expression on the "Williams" lease, on Operator's property in the Midway-Sunset Oil Field. CalGEM observed approximately one 4 barrel of crude oil on the ground, running through a dry creek bed. As the operator of the 5 Well, Operator was required to prevent surface expressions from occurring at its underground injection project in accordance with Regulations section 1724.11, subdivision (a), and it failed 6 7 to do so. Operator's failure to prevent a surface expression at its underground injection project 8 constitutes a violation of Regulations section 1724.11. Operator's failure also constitutes a 9 violation of its UIC Project Approval Letter, which prohibits "oil, steam, and/or water" from 10 "flowing to the surface as a result of cyclic steaming operations..." On May 6, 2024, CalGEM 11 issued a Notice of Violation to Operator, which is incorporated herein as Attachment B.

12 In response to the Notice of Violation, Operator submitted a Root Cause Analysis of the 13 surface expression and determined that the Well was the source of the surface expression, 14 citing holes in the Well's casing. After reviewing Operator's analysis, CalGEM accepted 15 Operator's determination that the Well was the source of the surface expression. Furthermore, 16 CalGEM's analysis determined that Operator's failure to remediate the Well contributed to the 17 occurrence of a surface expression. During a March 16, 2024 meeting between CalGEM and 18 Operator's personnel, a reservoir engineer in attendance, who worked for Operator, stated 19 that Operator's failure to timely remediate the Well was "a business decision." Operator's 20 personnel followed up with CalGEM after the meeting to explain that the failure to remediate 21 was an unintentional oversight by the Operator. CalGEM views the engineer's statement as 22 binding upon the Operator. Operator contends that the engineer's statement was uninformed 23 and that he did not have authority to speak on behalf of the Operator. Operator maintains 24 that the failure to remediate the Well was unintentional.

IV. **Civil Penalty**

26 Operator's failure to comply with idle well remediation requirements on the Well 27 following unsuccessful idle well testing is a violation of Regulations section 1772.1, subdivision 28 (b). Operator's failure to timely complete the required idle well remediation on the Well

4

constitutes one violation. Operator's failure to prevent a surface expression at its underground
 injection project is a violation of Regulations section 1724.11. Operator's failure to prevent the
 surface expression constitutes one violation.

Because of these two violations, and based on consideration of relevant
circumstances, consistent with PRC section 3236.5, by this order the Supervisor is imposing on
Operator civil penalties totaling \$27,500. Following is an explanation of how the civil penalty
amount was determined.

For purposes of this order, the Supervisor considered relevant circumstances, including:
characterizing the violations as "major," "minor," or "well stimulation" (as defined in PRC
section 3236.5, subdivision (b)) and setting a penalty amount proportionate to the
circumstantial importance of all relevant factors, including the eight factors identified in PRC
section 3236.5, subdivision (a). (PRC, § 3236.5, subd. (a).)

A. Failure to Comply with Idle Well Remediation Requirements

In determining the civil penalty amount for Operator's failure to complete the required
idle well remediation on the Well, the Supervisor determined the violation to be "minor." In
determining the civil penalty amount for Operator's failure to complete the required idle well
remediation on the Wells, the Supervisor determined each violation to be "minor." The
statutory maximum for a minor violation is \$2,500.

19 After consideration of all relevant factors, the Supervisor determined that a civil penalty 20 which is roughly proportionate to the most cost-effective method of performing the 21 remediation required is a balanced and effective incentive for operator compliance. In 22 determining the civil penalty amount, the Supervisor considered the potential risks associated 23 with idle wells and the economic benefit from avoiding the cost of compliance to the primary 24 considerations for determining an effective civil penalty amount. The required idle well testing 25 is critical for determining if an idle well has integrity. Idle wells that lack integrity have the 26 potential to harm air quality and groundwater. Similarly, by foregoing the required remediation 27 of the Wells, Operator has received a substantial economic benefit.

28 ///

13

An economic analysis of the costs of performing the idle well remediation substantially 1 2 exceeded the upper limit of the statutory penalty range for a minor violation. CalGEM 3 estimated the cost to perform a casing pressure test and a clean out tag between \$2,871 and 4 \$16,766 per well, depending on the location and condition of the well. CalGEM estimated the 5 cost to complete a partial plugging of a well between \$53,400 and \$65,947 per well, and the cost to plug and abandon a well between \$70,000 and \$96,000. Avoidance or deferral of this 6 7 cost is a significant economic benefit to Operator. A careful analysis of the eight factors 8 identified in PRC section 3236.5, subdivision (a), did not affect the Supervisor's finding that the 9 potential risks associated with the Wells and the economic benefit from avoiding the cost of compliance are the primary considerations for determining an effective civil penalty amount. 10 11 Therefore, the Supervisor determined that it is reasonable to impose a civil penalty of \$2,500 12 per well which is overdue for remediation. (PRC, § 3236.5, subd. (a).)

Based on Operator's one idle well which was not timely remediated, and with
appropriate consideration of relevant factors as described in PRC section 3236.5, the
Supervisor hereby imposes civil penalties totaling two thousand five hundred dollars (\$2,500)
for the violation of failing to complete the required remediation.

В.

17

B. Failure to Prevent a Surface Expression at an Underground Injection Project

18 In determining the civil penalty amount for Operator's failure to prevent a surface 19 expression at its underground injection project, the Supervisor determined the violation to be 20 "major." The statutory penalty range for a major violation is between \$2,500 and \$25,000. After 21 consideration of all relevant factors, the Supervisor determined that a civil penalty at the 22 maximum end of the penalty range was warranted given the significant threat to human 23 health and the environment resulting from the violation, and Operator's reservoir engineer's 24 statement to CalGEM that the violation was knowing, willful, and intentional. A careful analysis 25 of the eight factors identified in PRC section 3236.5, subdivision (a), did not affect the 26 Supervisor's finding that the extent of harm caused by the violation is the primary 27 consideration for determining an effective civil penalty amount. Surface expressions have the 28 potential to harm persons, property, and the environment, and present threats to wildlife and

1	groundwater, in light of which the Supervisor calculated a significant risk of harm. Therefore,
2	the Supervisor determined that it is reasonable to impose a civil penalty of \$25,000 for the
3	surface expression. (PRC, § 3236.5, subd. (a).)
4	Based on the surface expression which occurred at the Well, and with appropriate
5	consideration of relevant factors as described in PRC section 3236.5, the Supervisor hereby
6	imposes civil penalties totaling twenty-five thousand dollars (\$25,000) for the violation of failing
7	to prevent a surface expression at an underground injection project.
8	Taken together, the Supervisor imposes civil penalties totaling twenty-seven thousand
9	five hundred dollars (\$27,500) for the two violations.
10	V. <u>Operator's Required Actions</u>
11	For the reasons stated herein, pursuant to PRC sections 3013, 3106, 3206, 3206.1, 3224,
12	and 3236.5, and Regulations section 1772.1, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Operator:
13	1) Pay civil penalties totaling twenty-seven thousand five hundred dollars (\$27,500)
14	A continuing failure to pay the civil penalties may subject Operator to additional civil
15	penalties even if this order is appealed.
16	To remit payment of the civil penalty online, please visit
17	https://www.govone.com/PAYCAL/Home/SelectAgency and select "California Department
18	of Conservation Geologic Energy Management Division," then follow the instructions on the
19	screen.
20	To remit payment of the civil penalty by mail, please send a check payable to
21	"Department of Conservation" to the following address:
22	Department of Conservation

- 23 CalGEM, Attn: Operational Management Unit
- 24 715 P Street, MS 1803
- 25 Sacramento, California 95814
- 26 Please include the Operator name, Order number, and phrase "Oil and Gas

27 Environmental Remediation Account" on the check itself.

28 ///

1

VI.	Operator's Appeal Rights	

2	Operator may appeal this Order by filing a timely written notice of appeal with the	
3	Director as described in Article 6 (Appeals and Review) of Division 3 of the PRC, commencing	
4	with PRC section 3350. (PRC, §§ 3225, subd. (d).) If this order is mailed to you, the Director must	
5	receive the appeal within (15) days from the date the Supervisor mails the order. To file an	
6	appeal, a written notice of appeal may be sent via U.S. mail to:	
7	Department of Conservation	
8	Director's Office of Appeals	
9	715 P Street, MS 19-06 (Legal Office, Chief Counsel)	
10	Sacramento, California 95814	
11	Or via electronic mail:	
12	OfficeofAppeals@conservation.ca.gov	
13		
14	If Operator files a timely written notice of appeal, Operator will be informed of the	
15	appeal hearing date, time, and place. Following the hearing, Operator will receive a written	
16	decision that affirms, sets aside, or modifies the appealed order.	
17	If Operator does not file a timely written notice of appeal, or if the order is affirmed	
18	following an appeal, this order will become a final order and CalGEM may contract for	
19	performance of the work, pursuant to PRC section 3226, if, within 30 days of this order,	
20	Operator has not, in good faith, commenced the work ordered. Any costs incurred by	
21	CalGEM to obtain compliance with this order (which may include penalties and interest) will	
22	constitute a lien against Operator's real or personal property per PRC section 3423. (PRC, §	
23	3356.)	
24	VII. Other Potential Actions to Enforce This Order	
25	Failure to comply with Section IV (Operator's Required Actions) of this order could	

2 subject Operator to further enforcement action. PRC section 3236 makes it a misdemeanor 26 27 for any person who violates, fails, neglects, or refuses to comply with any of the provisions of the oil and gas conservation laws commencing at PRC section 3000. PRC section 3236.5 28

8

1	authorizes the Supervisor to impose a civil penalty on a person who violates any provision in
2	Chapter 1 of Division 3 of the PRC or any regulation that implements those statutes, and the
3	Supervisor may in the future impose further civil penalties based on the facts and omissions
4	underlying this order. PRC section 3237 authorizes the Supervisor to order the plugging and
5	abandonment of a well or the decommissioning of a production facility if an operator has
6	failed to comply with an order of the Supervisor within the time provided by the order or has
7	failed to challenge the order on a timely basis. PRC section 3359 makes it a misdemeanor to
8	fail or neglect to comply with an order of the Supervisor. Each day's further failure, refusal, or
9	neglect is a separate and distinct offense. (PRC, § 3359.)
10	
11	
12	DATED: Doug Ito
13	Doug Ito State Oil and Gas Supervisor
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	9 Order to Bay a Civil Bonalty No. 14604
	Order to Pay a Civil Penalty No. 1460A